

APPENDIX G—WILD AND SCENIC RIVERS STUDY PROCESS

I. INTRODUCTION

The Wild and Scenic Rivers Act (October 2, 1968, Public Law 90-542) establishes the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System (NWSRS), which is intended to preserve free-flowing rivers with outstandingly remarkable values (ORV) in their natural condition for the benefit of present and future generations, balancing the nation's water resource development policies with river conservation and recreation goals.

The Wild and Scenic Rivers Act states, "In all planning for the use and development of water and related land resources, consideration shall be given by all federal agencies involved to potential national wild, scenic and recreational river areas..." [Section 5(d) (1)]. Federal agencies consider potential rivers by evaluating a river's eligibility, tentative classification, and suitability for designation under the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act. This study process is part of the resource management planning effort for the Kanab Field Office.

Eligibility and tentative classification are determined by an inventory of existing conditions. Eligibility involves an evaluation of whether a river or river segment is free-flowing and possesses one or more ORVs. If found eligible, a river is analyzed as to its current level of development (e.g., water resources projects, shoreline development, and accessibility) and segmented accordingly. Each river segment is given one of three tentative classifications—"wild," "scenic," or "recreational"—based on the degree of development. The final procedural step, suitability, provides the basis for determining whether to recommend a river as part of the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System (NWSRS).

On December 13, 1994, an interagency agreement was signed by the Bureau of Land Management (BLM) (Utah State Office), the U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) Forest Service (Intermountain Region), and the National Park Service (Rocky Mountain Region). The agreement calls for the three agencies to "work cooperatively to define common criteria and processes for use in determining the eligibility and suitability of Utah rivers for potential inclusion by Congress in the [national system of Wild and Scenic Rivers]." The product of this agreement is the *Wild and Scenic River Review in the State of Utah: Process and Criteria for Interagency Use*, also known as the Utah Wild and Scenic River "Blue Book," published in June 1996. This publication supplements the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act by providing clear, specific criteria for identifying eligible rivers, including identification and evaluation of ORVs.

Guidance used for this study is also contained in the *Wild and Scenic Rivers—Policy and Program Direction for Identification, Evaluation, and Management, Bureau of Land Management Manual—8351*. In June 2004, the BLM issued IM-2004-196, which clarified policy in BLM Manual—8351 with respect to eligibility criteria and protective management. In addition, various technical papers published by the Interagency Wild and Scenic Rivers Coordination Council related to the evaluation of rivers were used. These publications may be found at www.nps.gov/rivers/publications.html.

II. ELIGIBILITY AND TENTATIVE CLASSIFICATION

Eligibility Determination Considerations

For a river to be eligible for inclusion in the national system of rivers, the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act specifies that certain criteria (discussed below) must be met. These criteria apply not only to each potentially eligible river but also to their immediate environment, which is defined as a river corridor extending, on average, ¼ mile from both sides of the high water mark. For purposes of the eligibility inventory, attention was not given to land ownership other than to ensure that at least some portion of a river segment crosses federal lands administered by the Kanab Field Office. The status of land ownership, however, is evaluated as a consideration in the suitability step of the study process, and is presented in detail in Section III of this appendix.

Free-Flowing Character

To be considered a free-flowing river, it must be a flowing body of water, or estuary, or section, portion, or tributary thereof, including rivers, streams, creeks, runs, kills, rills, and small lakes [Section 16 (a)]. A river can be any size or length, and does not have to be floatable or boatable. For purposes of eligibility determination, a river's flow is sufficient as long as it sustains or complements the ORV for which the river is found to be eligible. The body of water must be existing or flowing in a natural condition without major modification of the waterway, such as channelization, impoundment, diversion, straightening, rip-rapping, or other modification. However, some minor modifications can be allowed, such as low dams, diversion works, and minor structures [Section 16 (b)]. The river can lie between impoundments or major dams.

Outstandingly Remarkable Values

The Wild and Scenic Rivers Act specifies that rivers “with their immediate environment, must possess outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, geologic, fish and wildlife, historic, cultural, or other similar value” [Section 1 (b)].

The “Blue Book” further describes values and characteristics of each that are used to determine which values are outstandingly remarkable and at least regionally significant. The following summarizes the characteristics of each value that would render it rare, unique, or exemplary:

- **Scenic:** Diversity of view, special features, seasonal variations, and cultural features
- **Recreational:** Diversity of use, experience quality, length of season, access, level of use, attraction, sites and facilities, and associated opportunities
- **Geologic:** Feature abundance, diversity of features, and educational /scientific importance
- **Fish:** Habitat quality, diversity of species, values of species, abundance of fish, natural reproduction, size and vigor of fish, quality of experience, cultural/historic importance, recreational importance, and access
- **Wildlife:** Habitat quality, diversity of species, abundance of species, natural reproduction, size and vigor of fish, quality of experience, cultural/historic importance, recreational importance, and access
- **Historic:** Significance, site integrity, education/interpretation, and listing in or eligibility for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP)
- **Cultural:** Significance, current uses, number of cultures, site integrity, education/interpretation, and listing in or eligibility for listing in NRHP

- **Ecologic:** Species diversity, ecological function, rare communities, and educational/scientific features.

Because these values must be at least regionally significant to be considered outstandingly remarkable, a region of comparison is necessary to guide the evaluation of a value's significance. On May 8, 2002, an interagency team consisting of representatives of various National Forests, National Parks, and BLM offices within Utah concluded that using applicable ecological sections, or combinations of these sections, would be the most appropriate way to delineate regions of comparison. Ecological sections are basically subunits of physiographic provinces such as the Colorado Plateau.

Ecological sections provide clear parameters of major ecological systems as defined by geology, topography, climate, and so on, and are typically the most distinct, visible features of the landscape. They offer an excellent context with relative consistency of scenic, wildlife, and other values for comparison, and are large enough to encompass areas with similar values without forcing comparison of disparate values.

Team members relied on professional expertise, personal knowledge of the river segments, and field visits to determine if values were outstandingly remarkable. The interdisciplinary team generally defined the region of comparison as the Colorado Plateau. The region of comparison is intended to guide the evaluation, but it can vary for different resource considerations. The interdisciplinary team included an archeologist, hydrologist, geologist, rangeland specialists, wildlife biologist, recreation planner, realty specialist, landscape architect, land use planner, and geographic information system (GIS) specialist. If a segment was free-flowing and had at least one ORV, it was considered eligible. The team determined that 15 river segments were preliminarily eligible for congressional designation as Wild and Scenic Rivers.

Tentative Classification

Eligible rivers are given a tentative classification. The Wild and Scenic Rivers Act provides for three possible classifications: "wild," "scenic," or "recreational." These classifications, when applied to eligible rivers, are based on the type and degree of human development associated with the river and adjacent lands present at the time of inventory. They also prescribe what management activities would be allowed to occur along a river, as long as no ORV is compromised. The tentative classifications are based on the following:

- **Wild:** Rivers classified as "wild", which is the most restrictive Wild and Scenic River classification, are rivers that are free of impoundments and those that are generally inaccessible except by trail, with watersheds or shorelines essentially primitive and waters unpolluted.
- **Scenic:** Rivers classified as "scenic" are rivers that are generally free of impoundments, with shorelines or watersheds that are still largely primitive and shorelines that are largely undeveloped, but accessible in places by roads.
- **Recreational:** Rivers classified as "recreational" classification, which is the least restrictive Wild and Scenic River classification, are rivers that are readily accessible by road or railroad, that may have some development along their shorelines, and that may have substantial evidence of human activity.

The BLM may consider alternative tentative classifications at the time of evaluating suitability, as per BLM Manual 8351.33C, to resolve potential conflicts with other management objectives (whether BLM's or those of another official entity), provide continuity of management prescriptions, or on the basis of other management considerations within the river area. Final classification of a river segment is determined if and when a river is designated for entry into the national system.

Eligibility Determinations Process

The eligibility of the Paria River segment located within the Paria Canyon–Vermilion Cliffs Wilderness was determined in a previous study. The segment of the Paria River in Utah was found to be eligible in the Final Arizona Statewide Wild and Scenic Rivers Legislative Environmental Impact Statement, December 1994.

Coordination

In November 1997, a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) was signed between the State of Utah and the BLM by former governor, Mike Leavitt, and former BLM state director, William Lamb, to establish a cooperative effort for Wild and Scenic River study processes for BLM field offices in Utah. In addition, Kane County previously established a cooperative agreement with the BLM for land use planning in a MOU signed February 2004. Likewise, Garfield County agreed to cooperate in a similar MOU signed July 2004. These agreements enabled the BLM to expand the interdisciplinary team of specialists formed for this study process to include representatives from these governments.

Identification of Rivers for Review

The role of federal land management agencies is to review rivers under their jurisdictions to determine their eligibility, tentative classification, and suitability for congressional designation. A river means a flowing body of water or estuary or a section, portion, or tributary thereof, including rivers, streams, creeks, runs, kills, rills, and small lakes. The evaluation process began with the solicitation of public nominations for eligible rivers. During that process, no nominations were received from the public. The interdisciplinary team then considered all drainages crossing public lands within the Kanab Field Office decision area, as depicted on BLM 1:100,000 scale topographic maps. These drainages were reviewed to determine if they were (1) free-flowing and (2) contained any potential ORVs as defined in the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act. In addition, the BLM used information from the Utah Rivers Council and the National Rivers Inventory. In all, 50 drainages were reviewed.

Rivers Studied—Not Considered Further

The following rivers were considered potentially eligible in the initial review of the decision area. However, they were found to be ephemeral, not free-flowing, or void of any ORVs. As directed by IM-2004-196 (*Clarification of Policy in the BLM Manual Section 8351, Wild and Scenic Rivers, with Respect to Eligibility Criteria and Protective Management*), segments “should not be ephemeral (flow lasting only few days out of a year).”

- Johnson Wash—Ephemeral, not free-flowing.
- Fisher Canyon—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Robinson Creek—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Sink Valley Wash—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Trail Canyon—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Pugh Canyon—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Toms Canyon—Not free-flowing due to diversions.
- Maranger Canyon—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Willis Canyon (Complex)—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Oak Canyon—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Dairy Canyon—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Steep Trail Spring Canyon—No ORVs.
- Red Hollow—Not free-flowing, no ORVs.

- Dry Wash—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Lydia's Canyon—Not free-flowing, no ORVs.
- Smith Creek—Not free-flowing, no ORVs.
- Limekiln Creek—No ORVs.
- Peterson Wash—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Sanford Creek—No ORVs.
- Butler Wash—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Bunting Canyon—Ephemeral, no ORVs.
- Panguitch Creek—Mostly private, only 660 feet on BLM lands.
- Escalante Creek—Only 2,300 feet on land outside the Grand Staircase–Escalante National Monument (GSENM), character not the same as what was found suitable in GSENM plan. Was found not eligible in GSENM planning process.
- Buckskin Gulch—Ephemeral.
- Wire Pass—Ephemeral.
- Varney Griffin—No ORVs.

Potentially Eligible Rivers Considered

From among all of the streams identified, focus was narrowed by the interdisciplinary team to those identified as potentially eligible. Following the review of 50 drainages, 34 river segments were identified as potentially eligible or requiring further review. Table AG-1 is a list of these segments and the evaluation of findings.

Table AG-1. Summary of All Potentially Eligible River Segments Considered, and Identification of Outstandingly Remarkable Values

Segment Description	County	Drainage Type ⁱ	Free-Flowing ⁱⁱ	Potential Outstandingly Remarkable Value(s)
<u>North Fork Virgin River</u> —Segment 48-49 Section 31-33 (northeast of Zion National Park [NP]).	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Geologic Wildlife Recreational
<u>North Fork Virgin River</u> —Segment 46-47 Section 34 up to private land boundary in northwest quarter of Section 24.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Wildlife Recreational
<u>East Fork Virgin River</u> —Segment 36-41 private property to Zion NP boundary.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Geologic Wildlife Fish Historic Ecologic Recreational Cultural

Segment Description	County	Drainage Type ⁱ	Free-Flowing ⁱⁱ	Potential Outstandingly Remarkable Value(s)
<u>Orderville Gulch (Esplin Gulch)</u> —Segment 44-45 Zion NP boundary to the falls; Esplin Gulch Segment 45-45A.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Geologic Wildlife Ecologic
<u>Bob Creek (tributary of Orderville Gulch)</u> —Segment 42-43 from diversion to Bob Creek in Section 6.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic
<u>Meadow Creek / Mineral Gulch</u> —Segments 33-35 and 35-38 south of Highway 9 to confluence with Mineral Gulch, then to confluence with East Fork Virgin River.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Geologic
<u>Deep Creek</u> —Segment 50-51 from Washington County line to BLM boundary in Section 30.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic
<u>Kanab Creek</u> —Segment 7-8 south of Alton at Alton Sink Valley Road to the falls.	Kane	Perennial	No	None
<u>Kanab Creek</u> —Segment 8-9 from falls to BLM boundary in northeast corner in Section 32.	Kane	Intermittent	Yes	Scenic Recreational Wildlife
<u>Kanab Creek</u> —Segment 9-10 from Point 9 to dam north of Kanab.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Wildlife
<u>Cottonwood Creek</u> —Segment 28-29 beginning in Section 10 at BLM boundary, ending at confluence with Indian Canyon.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Wildlife Cultural
<u>Cottonwood Creek</u> —Segment 31-32 beginning at confluence with Indian Canyon to BLM boundary in Section 3.	Kane	Perennial	No	None
<u>Indian Canyon</u> —Segment 26-27 from head of canyon to confluence with Cottonwood Creek.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Geologic Ecologic
<u>South Fork Indian Canyon</u> —Segment 22-23 from head of South Fork Indian Canyon to BLM boundary in northeast corner of Section 20.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Wildlife Cultural Ecologic
<u>North Branch of South Fork Indian Canyon</u> —Segment 23-24 from point where canyon deepens to BLM boundary in southeast corner of Section 17.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Geologic Cultural Ecologic

Segment Description	County	Drainage Type ⁱ	Free-Flowing ⁱⁱ	Potential Outstandingly Remarkable Value(s)
<u>Water Canyon</u> —Segment 20-21 beginning at head of canyon to BLM boundary in Section 21.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Geologic Ecologic
<u>Hell Dive Canyon</u> —Segment 30-31 from point where canyon deepens to confluence with Cottonwood Creek.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Geologic Cultural Ecologic
<u>Thompson Creek</u> —Segment 5-6 beginning at BLM boundary just south of confluence with Birch Creek to BLM boundary at south end of Section 19.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	None
<u>Mill Creek (tributaries)</u> —Segment 2-4 beginning at BLM boundary in southeast corner of Section 34 to BLM boundary in eastern part of Section 20.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	None
<u>Mill Creek (tributaries)</u> —Segment 1-3 Mineral Creek from BLM property line in Section 4 to confluence with Mill Creek.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	None
<u>Hog Canyon (tributaries)</u> —Segment 16-19 beginning at headwaters to TV Hill Road in Section 10.	Kane	Intermittent	Yes	None
<u>Hog Canyon (tributaries)</u> —Segment 17-18 South Fork Hog Canyon, beginning at headwaters in Section 12 to confluence with main stem Hog Canyon in Section 11.	Kane	Intermittent	Yes	None
<u>Hog Canyon (tributaries)</u> —Segment 14-15 North Fork Hog Canyon beginning at Crocodile Road in Section 34 to confluence with main stem.	Kane	Intermittent	Yes	None
<u>Tiny Canyon</u> —Section 10-11 beginning at BLM boundary in Section 6 to confluence with Kanab Creek.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Wildlife
<u>Paria River</u> —Segment 68-69 beginning at Wilderness/GSENM boundary to Arizona border; entire segment is within Paria Canyon–Vermilion Cliffs Wilderness.	Kane	Perennial	Yes	Scenic Recreational Geologic Wildlife
<u>Sevier River</u> —Segment 53-55 beginning at BLM boundary in Section 6 north to BLM boundary in Section 8.	Garfield	Perennial	No	None
<u>Sevier River</u> —Segment 52-53 from BLM boundary in Section 8 to BLM boundary in northeast part of Section 15 north of Hatch.	Garfield	Perennial	No	None

Segment Description	County	Drainage Type ⁱ	Free-Flowing ⁱⁱ	Potential Outstandingly Remarkable Value(s)
<u>Three Mile Creek</u> —Segment 56-57 beginning at the Dixie National Forest boundary in Section 11 to BLM boundary in Section 7.	Garfield	Perennial	Yes	Fish
<u>Sandy Creek</u> —Segment 58-59 beginning at BLM boundary in Section 35 to State boundary in Section 35.	Garfield	Perennial	Yes	None
<u>Bear Creek</u> —Segment 60-61 from BLM boundary in Section 6 to BLM boundary in Section 9.	Garfield	Perennial	No	None
<u>Choke Cherry Creek</u> —Segment 54-55 from BLM boundary in Section 11 to confluence with Sevier River.	Garfield	Perennial	Yes	None
<u>Birch Creek</u> —Segment 64-65 from BLM boundary in Section 11 to BLM boundary in Section 17.	Garfield	Perennial	Yes	None
<u>North Creek (tributaries)</u> —Segment 66-67 from BLM boundary to BLM boundary in Section 9-16.	Garfield	Perennial	Yes	None
<u>Upper Valley Creek</u> —Segment 58-59 from BLM boundary in Section 4 to BLM boundary in Section 17 just upstream of confluence with Birch Creek.	Garfield	Perennial	No	None

Notes:

i - Drainages were identified as one of three types:

- **Perennial**—Stream that flows continuously. Perennial streams are generally associated with a water table in the localities through which they flow.
- **Intermittent**—Stream that flows only at certain times of the year when it receives water from springs or from some surface source such as melting snow in mountainous areas.
- **Ephemeral**—Stream that flows only in direct response to precipitation, and whose channel is above the water table at all times.

ii "Free-flowing"—Means existing or flowing in a natural condition without impoundment, diversion, straightening, rip-rapping, or other modifications of the waterway. The existence, however, of low dams, diversion works, or other minor structures at the time any river is proposed for inclusion in the National Wild and Scenic River System shall not bar its consideration for such inclusion.

Identification of Outstandingly Remarkable Values

Following interdisciplinary team review of the 34 segments, 18 segments were identified as being free-flowing, being either perennial or intermittent, and potentially possessing one or more ORVs. Table AG-2 identifies and describes the ORV analysis of these 18 segments.

Table AG-2. Evaluation of Outstandingly Remarkable Values

North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 Section 31-33 (northeast of Zion NP). Eligible in Section 31-32	Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Entire segment is rated as Class A scenery. • Recreational—Used for hiking (which requires a permit to enter Zion NP, the Narrows). Segment is highly valued for hiking, backpacking, nature study, and photography in an exceptionally scenic, wilderness-quality setting. • Wildlife—Possible neotropical migratory bird habitat
---	---

<p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>(Migratory Bird Treaty Act, Executive Order 13186). Spotted owl (threatened species) designated critical habitat cooperatively managed with Zion NP.</p> <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
<p>North Fork Virgin River Segment 46-47 Section 34 up to private land boundary in northwest quarter of Section 24.</p> <p>Not Eligible</p>	<p>Values evaluated, none determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Entire segment is rated as Class A scenery, but the scenery is not notable, scarce, or exemplary when compared with other scenery in the region. • Wildlife—Spotted owl designated critical habitat is present; however, checkerboard ownership makes management difficult. • Recreational—Not much recreational use due to large amounts of private property.
<p>East Fork Virgin River Segment 36-41 private land to Zion NP boundary.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild, Scenic, and Recreational</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Entire segment is rated as Class A scenery. • Cultural—Numerous cultural resource sites considered eligible for listing in NRHP within the river canyon, plus dense concentrations of Virgin Anasazi sites situated on benches above the canyon. • Recreational—Segment is highly valued for hiking, backpacking, nature study, and photography in an exceptionally scenic, wilderness-quality setting. • Fish—Habitat and populations of sensitive fish. • Wildlife—Possible neotropical migratory bird habitat (Migratory Bird Treaty Act, Executive Order 13186), sensitive amphibian habitat. Spotted owl designated critical habitat. • Historic—John Wesley Powell exploration in the river canyon in 1872. • Ecologic—Unique plant community (hanging gardens). <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
<p>Orderville Gulch (Esplin Gulch) Segment 44-45 Zion NP boundary to the falls; Esplin Gulch Segment 45-45A.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Entire segment is rated as Class A scenery. • Recreational—Segment is heavily used and highly valued for hiking, photography, and canyoneering. Opportunities in a canyon setting very similar to those in adjacent Zion NP. • Wildlife—Possible neotropical migratory bird habitat (Migratory Bird Treaty Act, Executive Order 13186). Spotted owl nesting habitat. • Ecologic—Unique plant community (hanging gardens). <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
<p>Bob Creek (tributary of Orderville Gulch) Segment 42-43 from diversion to Bob Creek in</p>	<p>Values evaluated, none determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Entire segment is rated as Class A scenery, but

<p>Section 6.</p> <p>Not Eligible</p>	<p>the scenery is not notable, scarce, or exemplary when compared with other scenery in the region.</p>
<p>Meadow Creek / Mineral Gulch</p> <p>Segments 33-35 and 35-38 south of Highway 9 to confluence with Mineral Gulch, then to confluence with East Fork Virgin River.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Majority of segment is Class A scenery. Scenic values of sculptured slickrock and ledges untouched by human influence. • Recreational—Segment is popular with visitors seeking exceptionally scenic hiking, backpacking, photography, and nature study opportunities in a dramatic, deep canyon setting where solitude abounds. <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
<p>Deep Creek</p> <p>Segment 50-51 from Washington County line to BLM boundary in Section 30.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Value evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Entire segment is rated as Class A scenery; access is limited due to surrounding private property.
<p>Kanab Creek</p> <p>Segment 8-9 from the falls to BLM boundary in northeast corner in Section 32.</p> <p>Not Eligible</p>	<p>Values evaluated, none determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Deep gorge carved in Navajo Sandstone with mature ponderosa pine; approximately 50% of segment is in Class A scenery, but the scenery is not especially outstanding when compared with other scenery in the region. • Recreational—Most recreation use is by local residents and is similar in nature to that occurring in several other similar settings near Kanab. • Wildlife—Little riparian vegetation. No Southwestern willow flycatcher habitat. Within Paunsaguant deer herd management area.
<p>Kanab Creek</p> <p>Segment 9-10 from Point 9 to dam north of Kanab.</p> <p>Not Eligible</p>	<p>Values evaluated, none determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Scenery is not notable, scarce, or exemplary when compared with other scenery in the region. • Wildlife—Neotropical migratory bird habitat; however, it is not exemplary when compared with other habitat in the region. • Recreational—Most recreation use is by local residents.
<p>Cottonwood Creek</p> <p>Segment 28-29 beginning in Section 10 at BLM boundary ending at confluence with Indian Canyon.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recreational—Canyon offers exceptional non-motorized/non-mechanized recreation opportunities in an enticing canyon setting. • Cultural—Two eligible sites within segment, but NRHP-listed site 42Ka1581 Cottonwood Canyon Cliff Dwellings and four nearby rock art sites, are found in a tributary canyon to the east. • Wildlife—Neotropical migratory bird habitat (Migratory Bird

	<p>Treaty Act, Executive Order 13186).</p> <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Class A scenery; scenery is not especially notable, scarce, or exemplary when compared with other scenery in the vicinity of Kanab.
<p>Indian Canyon</p> <p>Segment 26-27 from head of canyon to confluence with Cottonwood Creek.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Deep, narrow canyon, Class A scenery. • Recreational—Canyon offers non-motorized/non-mechanized recreation opportunities (e.g., hiking, canyoneering, photography, and nature study) in a highly scenic and diverse canyon setting. • Ecologic—Unique plant community (hanging gardens). <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
<p>South Fork Indian Canyon</p> <p>Segment 22-23 from head of South Fork Indian Canyon to BLM boundary in northeast corner of Section 20.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Deep, narrow canyon, Class A scenery. • Recreational—Canyon offers exceptional non-motorized/non-mechanized recreation opportunities (e.g., hiking, canyoneering, photography, and nature study) in a highly scenic and diverse canyon setting. • Ecologic—Unique plant community (hanging gardens). <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
<p>North Branch of South Fork Indian Canyon</p> <p>Segment 24-25 from point where canyon deepens to BLM boundary in southeast corner of Section 17.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Deep, narrow canyon, Class A scenery. • Recreational—Canyon offers exceptional non-motorized/non-mechanized recreation opportunities (e.g., hiking, canyoneering, photography, and nature study) in a highly scenic and diverse canyon setting. • Cultural—One recorded site, 42Ka1576 South Fork Indian Canyon Pictographs, eligible for listing in NRHP. • Ecologic—Unique plant community (hanging gardens); <i>Zion jamesia</i> (sensitive plant) is present. <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
<p>Water Canyon</p> <p>Segment 20-21 from point where canyon deepens to BLM boundary in Section 21.</p> <p>Eligible</p> <p>Tentative Classification: Wild</p>	<p>Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Deep, narrow canyon, Class A scenery. • Recreational—Canyon offers non-motorized/mechanized recreation opportunities (e.g., hiking, canyoneering, photography, and nature study) in a highly scenic and diverse canyon setting. • Ecologic—Unique plant community (hanging gardens); <i>Zion jamesia</i> (sensitive plant) is present. <p>Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.

Hell Dive Canyon Segment 30-31 from point where canyon deepens to confluence with Cottonwood Creek. Eligible Tentative Classification: Wild	Values evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Deep, narrow canyon, Class A scenery. • Recreational—Canyon offers exceptional non-motorized/non-mechanized recreation opportunities (e.g., hiking, canyoneering, photography, and nature study) in a highly scenic and diverse canyon setting. • Cultural—One recorded rockshelter/rock art/structural site, eligible for listing in NRHP. • Ecology—Unique plant community (hanging gardens); <i>Zion jamesia</i> (sensitive plant) is present. Value evaluated, not determined outstandingly remarkable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geologic—All exposed formations can be seen in several other canyons in the area, and are not rare or unique.
Paria River Segment 68-69 beginning at Wilderness/GSENM boundary to Arizona border; entire segment is within Paria Canyon–Vermilion Cliffs Wilderness. Eligible Tentative Classification: Wild	Value determined outstandingly remarkable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenic—Class A scenery. • Wildlife—Neotropical migratory bird habitat (Migratory Bird Treaty Act, Executive Order 13186). • Recreational—Wilderness hiking and backpacking; opportunities for primitive experience and solitude in a dramatic, narrow desert canyon setting.
Three Mile Creek Segment 56-57 beginning at the Dixie National Forest boundary in Section 11 to BLM boundary in Section 7. Eligible Tentative Classification: Recreation	Value evaluated and determined outstandingly remarkable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fish—Bonneville cutthroat trout (sensitive species) present.

Summary of Rivers Determined Eligible

Following analysis of the ORVs, 15 segments (identified in Table AG-3) were determined to be either perennial or intermittent, free-flowing, and possessing ORVs, judged regionally or nationally significant, and, therefore, declared eligible for inclusion in the NWSRS. These eligible segments are analyzed in the Draft RMP/EIS for their potential suitability for inclusion in the NWSRS.

Table AG-3. Rivers Determined Eligible for Designation into the NWSRS

Segment Name	Outstandingly Remarkable Value(s)	Miles in Decision Area	River Corridor (acres)	River Corridor in Decision Area (acres)	% of River Corridor in Decision Area
North Fork Virgin River	scenic, recreational, wildlife	2.2	500	430	86
East Fork Virgin River (three segments)	scenic, cultural, recreational, fish, wildlife, historical, ecologic	13.5	2,510	2,510	100

Segment Name	Outstandingly Remarkable Value(s)	Miles in Decision Area	River Corridor (acres)	River Corridor in Decision Area (acres)	% of River Corridor in Decision Area
Orderville Gulch (Esplin Gulch)	scenic, recreational, wildlife, ecologic	3.2	640	590	92
Meadow Creek/Mineral Gulch	scenic, recreational	9.2	1,780	1,760	99
Deep Creek	scenic	0.7	210	130	62
Cottonwood Creek	recreational, cultural, wildlife	1.1	320	280	87
Indian Canyon	scenic, recreational, ecologic	0.7	160	140	88
South Fork Indian Canyon	scenic, recreational, ecologic	1.8	490	450	92
North Branch of South Fork Indian Canyon	scenic, recreational, cultural, ecologic	0.4	110	90	82
Water Canyon	scenic, recreational, ecologic	3.2	710	710	100
Hell Dive Canyon	scenic, recreational, cultural, ecologic	1.4	350	350	100
Paria River	scenic, wildlife, recreational	4.8	1,090	1,020	100
Three Mile Creek	fish	3.7	850	770	91
Totals		45.9	9,720	9,200	95

III. SUITABILITY

Determination of Suitability

Rivers determined to be eligible for inclusion into the NWSRS are further evaluated to determine their suitability for inclusion into the national system.

The purpose of the suitability step of the study process is to determine whether eligible rivers would be appropriate additions to the national system by considering tradeoffs between corridor development and river protection. Suitability considerations include the environmental and economic consequences of designation and the manageability of a river if it were designated by Congress.

The EIS evaluates impacts that would result if the eligible rivers were determined suitable and managed to protect their free-flowing nature, tentative classification, and ORVs. It also addresses impacts that would result if the eligible rivers are determined not suitable and their values are not provided protective management. The range of alternatives include the no action alternative (Alternative A), which does not address or provide for decisions on suitability, but leaves rivers eligible, and Alternative C, which finds all eligible rivers suitable. Alternative D finds none of the eligible rivers suitable; Alternative B finds some eligible rivers suitable. Alternative tentative classifications are also evaluated.

In addition to the impact analysis addressed by alternative, the following suitability considerations are applied to each eligible river:

- Characteristics that do or do not make the area a worthy addition to the national system
- Status of land ownership and use in the area
- Uses, including reasonably foreseeable potential uses, of the area and related waters that would be enhanced, foreclosed, or curtailed if the area were included in the national system of rivers; and the values that could be foreclosed or diminished if the area is not protected as part of the national system
- Interest by federal, tribal, state, local, and other public entities in designation or non-designation of a river, including the extent to which the administration of the river, including the costs thereof, *can be shared by the above mentioned entities*
- Ability of the agency to manage and protect the values of a river area if it were designated, and other mechanisms to protect identified values other than Wild and Scenic Rivers designation
- The estimated cost, if necessary, of acquiring lands, interests in lands, and administering the area if it were included in the national system
- The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments.

Coordination

A series of interdisciplinary meetings was held from October 2005 through September 2006 during the suitability step of the study process. Cooperating agencies also participated in the process and attended the meetings. In addition to numerous internal meetings, a series of meetings and field trips were held in summer 2006 to review potentially eligible/suitable segments with cooperating agencies.

Suitability Study

Public comments received on the *Draft Evaluation Report: Wild and Scenic River Eligibility Kanab Resource Management Plan* have been used to improve the documentation of the suitability considerations presented below, and to document the impacts that would result from the various alternatives. The actual determination of whether or not each eligible river segment is suitable is a decision that will be made in the Record of Decision for the Kanab Resource Management Plan (RMP).

North Fork Virgin River—Segment 48-49

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, and wildlife values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This entire segment is rated Class A scenery. The lack of man-made structures; variety of natural shapes, textures, and colors; and the gradual transition from a relatively open valley stream setting to a deeply entrenched, prominent slot canyon make the North Fork Virgin River exceptionally scenic and photogenic.

Recreational

Because the North Fork serves as the main entrance to the Zion Narrows trek within Zion National Park (NP), the main recreation activity involves trekkers accessing the park. The outstanding scenery and wilderness-like setting make the trek along the river unique and exceptionally satisfying. Day use activities include hiking into portions of the canyon, nature photography, wildlife viewing, and occasional hunting. Private land upstream of the BLM segment limits off-highway-vehicle (OHV) use to only an occasional authorized vehicle. There is no motorized travel allowed beyond the east boundary of the North Fork Virgin River Wilderness Study Area (WSA).

Wildlife

This segment includes possible neotropical migratory bird habitat. It is also Mexican spotted owl designated critical habitat.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 86 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment is used by recreationists to access the narrows within Zion NP. The upper reach of this segment, above the canyon narrows, is used for livestock grazing and dispersed recreation. Private land ownership upstream of the WSA limits motorized access to the river segment.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Current recreational uses would be preserved by congressional designation, protecting the values associated with the non-motorized uses and perceived natural condition and scenic values. Recreational enhancements would be limited to increased signage and management if designated.

The North Fork Virgin River WSA includes 46 percent of the public lands along this segment. These lands have been recommended by the BLM to Congress for wilderness designation. Designation of this stream into the NWSRS would be compatible with and would enhance wilderness use and management of the area.

Congressional designation would provide permanent protection specifically for the free-flowing condition of the river, its water quality, and its ORVs. This would be in addition to protection already afforded by the WSA status. Failure to include the river segment in the NWSRS, on the other hand, would not necessarily diminish the values on the basis of which the river was determined eligible inasmuch as the area's WSA status would continue. Furthermore, many of the other land use prescriptions (e.g., Special Recreation Management Area [SRMA] designation) being considered in the EIS would also preserve and enhance such values if implemented. Such prescriptions would be temporary, however, and could be changed through plan amendment or plan revision.

Inclusion of a river into the NWSRS could preclude the construction of dams or other water-related projects if they would occur within the designated segment and have direct and/or adverse effects on the ORVs (e.g., scenic, recreational, and wildlife) or free-flowing condition. None are currently proposed. Other projects on federal lands within the designated river area, such as construction of roads, pipelines, or other structures, would not be allowed, and the lands would be closed to mineral location if Congress were to classify this segment as "wild." However, considering the area's WSA status, no such development is currently proposed or foreseeable within the federal portion of this segment. Water-related projects proposed outside the segment would be precluded only if they would invade or unreasonably

diminish scenic, recreational, or wildlife values within the designated segment. None are currently proposed.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

The National Park Service (NPS) has recommended the river portion that extends within Zion NP for Wild and Scenic River designation. Administration of recreation resources and activities within the segment could be shared with Zion NP.

Local and state agencies and water users oppose designation primarily over their concerns that current and potential water use of this or any eligible stream could be affected. However, there are no current or foreseen uses that would be affected. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups have promoted the suitability of this stream for congressional designation. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation. Kane County comments state, "If determined suitable the County suggests the segment begin at the WSA boundary where it incises into the canyon rather than at the proposed location in the valley."

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

Land status and classification level would not create problems for manageability. The BLM would be capable of managing this segment if it were designated, particularly with adequate funding. Wild and Scenic River designation would increase the Utah BLM's ability to compete for agency dollars, and with increased funding and focused management, the agency's ability to deal with recreational management of the area would improve. Designation would promote national and public recognition of the values associated with this segment and further the goals and policy established by Congress in the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act.

The free-flowing nature of this stream is not currently at risk, and the identified ORVs on public lands could be effectively managed under land use prescriptions being considered in the EIS, if designation does not occur and if the management prescriptions are implemented. These prescriptions would be associated with the North Fork Virgin River WSA. The river corridor within the WSA is managed according to the Interim Management Policy (IMP). Protection would also be afforded by designation of the North Fork Virgin River SRMA. The status of the WSA, SRMA, and other management prescriptions is subject to change due to congressional action or revised land use plans. Therefore, the protection these designations afford the river values is subject to change. However, the isolation of the stream due to the very limited public access and the extreme topography inevitably provides additional protection.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

Costs could be reduced due to shared management with the NPS. Possible costs could be incurred due to acquisition of a small portion of the segment currently in private ownership. However, Kane County has a "no net loss" policy regarding private property, and would be unsupportive of BLM attempts to acquire private land. There is a concern about private riparian lands in the corridor. Other costs could be related to a management plan, if shared management with the NPS is not feasible.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

State and local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs of designated streams.

East Fork Virgin River—Segment 37-41

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, cultural, historic, fish, wildlife, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This entire segment is rated as Class A scenery, and is characterized by colorful sandstone canyon rims rising several hundred feet above the river valley floor. The river meanders frequently along a ribbon of riparian vegetation. Streamside cliffs and distant slopes and precipices range from light buff shades to dark reds and browns, all sprinkled with various greens and yellows of the many trees, shrubs, forbs, and grasses of Parunuweap Canyon. Spring and early summer blossoms add touches of red, orange, yellow, and pale blue wildflowers. Signs of human occupation or disturbance along the river segment are rare, so the scenery is thoroughly primitive, spectacularly wild, and wholly natural in appearance.

Recreational

The East Fork Virgin River flows directly into the southeastern portion of Zion NP, and the scenery is very similar to that portion of the park. Typical recreation use consists of backpackers conducting multi-day trips from the upper reach of the river within the Parunuweap WSA to the exit route near Checkerboard Mesa in the park. Day hikes to various portions of the river segment are also common. All-terrain vehicle (ATV) riders occasionally reach the river shores, although motorized travel is restricted by WSA interim management to only one or two sites along the entire river segment. Canyoneering, wildlife viewing, and nature study are frequent attractions to visitors. Hunting is allowed, but is not often encountered along the river segment because of the lack of easy motorized access and the steep slopes and cliffs along the river bank the farther downstream one travels.

Cultural

There are numerous cultural resource sites considered eligible for listing in the NRHP within the river canyon, and there are dense concentrations of Virgin Anasazi sites situated on the benches above the canyon. Older and younger sites are present as well. These sites, especially those within the narrow confines of the canyon, are an important scientific resource that contributes to the ORVs of this river segment.

Historic

John Wesley Powell explored this river canyon in 1872.

Fish

This segment includes habitat and populations of native fish. It is also the upland watershed for sensitive fisheries downstream of the Zion NP boundary.

Wildlife

This segment includes possible neotropical migratory bird habitat and sensitive amphibian habitat. It is also Mexican spotted owl designated critical habitat.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens).

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 100 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment has been used for accessing the Fat Man's Misery portion of Zion NP; however, Zion NP does not permit use through its portion of Parunuweap Canyon. There are high levels of non-motorized recreation use on the public lands portions of the canyon. Lands associated with this segment are also used for livestock grazing. Kane County claims two RS-2477 rights-of-way within proximity to the river. Although one route is not currently used for crossing the river, the historic route of the other road crosses the river several times in the space of about 3 miles, just upstream from this river segment. Both routes are open to OHV travel according to county ordinance.

This entire segment is within the Parunuweap WSA and is managed according to the (IMP). The IMP does not allow for new developments or surface-disturbing activity.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Designation of this segment as a "wild" river segment could create conflict with use along the RS-2477 claimed routes.

Uses and values that would be affected by congressional designation are also addressed in the cumulative impacts section of the EIS.

All of the public lands within this segment of the East Fork Virgin River are within the Parunuweap Canyon WSA. This portion of the WSA has been recommended by BLM to Congress for wilderness designation. Designation of this stream into the NWSRS would be compatible with and enhance wilderness use and management of the area.

Congressional designation would provide permanent protection specifically of the free-flowing condition of the river, its water quality, and its ORVs. This would be in addition to the protection already afforded by the WSA status. Failure to include this segment of the East Fork Virgin River in the NWSRS, on the other hand, would not necessarily diminish the values on the basis of which the river was determined eligible, inasmuch as the area's WSA status would continue and other land use prescriptions (e.g., Parunuweap SRMA) being considered in the Draft RMP/EIS would also preserve and enhance such values if implemented. Such prescriptions would be temporary, however, and could be changed.

Inclusion of a river into the NWSRS could preclude construction of dams or other water-related projects if they would occur within the designated segment and would have direct and/or adverse effects on the ORVs or free-flowing condition. None are currently proposed. Other projects on federal lands within the designated river area, such as construction of roads, pipelines, or other structures, would not be allowed, and the lands would be closed to mineral location if Congress were to classify this segment as "wild." However, considering the area's WSA status, no such development is currently proposed or foreseeable. Water-related projects proposed outside the segment would be precluded only if they would invade or unreasonably diminish scenic, recreational, cultural, historic, fish, wildlife, or ecologic values within the designated segment. None are currently proposed.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

The NPS has recommended the river portion that extends within Zion NP for WSR designation. Administration of recreational resources and activities within the segment could be shared with Zion NP.

State and local governments might support congressional designation of this segment, but not upstream of the claimed RS-2477 roads. Kane County representatives have noted that the county would be more comfortable supporting designation of the lower portion of the segment where the canyon is void of roads or development.

Local and state agencies and water users oppose designation primarily over their concerns that current and potential water use of this or any eligible segments could be affected. However, there are no current or foreseen uses of the river segment that would be affected. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups have promoted the suitability of this segment for congressional designation. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See initial paragraph under suitability consideration #5 for North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above. The river segment would be manageable due to public land ownership, but RS-2477 assertions could create conflicts in management.

The free-flowing nature of this stream is not currently at risk, and the identified ORVs on public lands could be effectively managed under land use prescriptions being considered in the EIS, if designation does not occur and if the management prescriptions are implemented. These prescriptions would be associated with the Parunuweap Canyon WSA. The river corridor within the WSA is managed according to the IMP. Protection would also be afforded river values by the proposed Parunuweap SRMA. The status of the WSA, SRMA, and other management prescriptions is subject to change due to congressional action or revised land use plans. Therefore, the protection these designations afford the river values is subject to change. However, the isolation of the stream due to the very limited public access and the extreme topography inevitably provides additional protection.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

The initial costs of administration for the first 3 years would involve preparing a management plan. Yearly administration costs thereafter would involve plan implementation, and may include additional studies and monitoring as well as additional BLM presence in the area. Long-term costs would be related primarily to enforcement. Costs could be reduced by sharing management with the NPS. Other costs could be related to a management plan, if shared management with the NPS is not feasible.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

State and local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs of designated streams.

East Fork Virgin River—Segment 36-37

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, cultural, historic, fish, wildlife, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This entire segment is rated as Class A scenery, and is characterized by colorful sandstone canyon rims rising several hundred feet above the river valley floor. The river meanders frequently along a ribbon of riparian vegetation. Streamside cliffs and distant slopes and precipices range from light buff shades to dark reds and browns, all sprinkled with various greens and yellows of the many trees, shrubs, forbs, and grasses of Parunuweap Canyon. Spring and early summer blossoms add touches of red, orange, yellow, and pale blue wildflowers. Signs of human occupation or disturbance along the river segment are limited to vehicle tracks crossing the river at several locations, so the scenery is heavily primitive, wild, and natural in appearance.

Recreational

The East Fork Virgin River flows directly into the southeastern portion of Zion NP, and the scenery is similar to that portion of the park. Typical recreation use consists of backpackers conducting multi-day trips from the upper reach of the river within the Parunuweap WSA to the exit route near Checkerboard Mesa in the park. Day hikes to various portions of the river segment are also common. ATV riders traverse the stream channel along the entire river segment. Wildlife viewing and nature study are frequent attractions to visitors. Hunting and OHV touring are other popular activities along this segment.

Cultural

There are numerous cultural resource sites considered eligible for listing in the NRHP within the river canyon, and there are dense concentrations of Virgin Anasazi sites situated on the benches above the canyon. Older and younger sites are present as well. These sites, especially those within the narrow confines of the canyon, are an important scientific resource that contributes to the ORVs of this river segment.

Historic

John Wesley Powell explored the river canyon in 1872.

Fish

This segment includes habitat for and populations of sensitive fish.

Wildlife

This segment has possible neotropical migratory bird habitat and sensitive amphibian habitat. It is also Mexican spotted owl designated critical habitat.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens).

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 100 percent federally managed public lands. The road within the corridor is adjacent to the river, crosses it several times, and is currently open to motorized recreation. The area is also popular for hunting, nature study, and horseback riding. Livestock grazing occurs along this segment and on adjacent lands; there are also range improvements to support livestock grazing. The segment is completely within the Parunuweap Canyon WSA and is managed according to the IMP.

Present within or along the majority of this segment of the East Fork Virgin River is a historical OHV route. Thus, vehicle-based recreation occurs often on the route, except for during periods of high runoff during spring snowmelt or flash flood events.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Designation as “recreational” would not diminish motorized use on the route or hunting. Uses and values that would be affected by congressional designation are also addressed in the cumulative impacts section of the EIS.

The entire reach of this segment of the East Fork Virgin River is within the Parunuweap Canyon WSA. This portion of the WSA has been recommended by BLM to Congress for wilderness designation. Designation of this segment into the NWSRS would be compatible with and would enhance wilderness use and management of the area. Congressional designation would provide permanent protection specifically of the free-flowing condition of the river, its water quality, and its ORVs. This would be in addition to protection already afforded to the river corridor by the WSA status. Within the WSA, failure to include this segment in the NWSRS, on the other hand, would not necessarily diminish the values for which the segment was determined eligible, inasmuch as the area’s WSA status would continue, and other land use prescriptions (e.g., SRMA designation) being considered in the EIS would also preserve and enhance such values if implemented. Such prescriptions would be temporary, however, and could be changed through plan amendment or plan revision.

Inclusion of a river into the NWSRS could preclude construction of dams or other water-related projects if they would occur within the designated segment and would have direct and/or adverse effects on the ORVs (scenic, recreational, cultural, historic, fish, wildlife, and ecologic) or free-flowing condition. Water-related projects proposed outside the segment would be precluded only if they would invade or unreasonably diminish those ORVs within the designated segment. No such projects inside or immediately outside of the river area are currently proposed.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

The NPS has recommended the river portion that extends within Zion NP for WSR designation.

Local and state agencies and water users oppose designation primarily over their concerns that current and potential water use of this or any eligible stream could be affected. However, there are no current or foreseen uses of the East Fork Virgin River that would be affected. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups have promoted the suitability of this stream for congressional designation. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See initial paragraph under suitability consideration #5 for North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above. The free-flowing nature of this segment is not currently at risk, and the identified ORVs could, for the most part, be effectively managed under land use prescriptions being considered in the EIS, if designation does not occur and if the management prescriptions are implemented. These prescriptions would be associated with visual and cultural resource management and the Parunuweap SRMA. Protection is also currently afforded this portion of the segment corridor by Parunuweap Canyon WSA. The river corridor within the WSA is managed according to the IMP. The status of the WSA, SRMA, and other management prescriptions is subject to change due to congressional action or revised land use plans. Therefore, the protection they afford the river values is subject to change.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

Costs would be the same as those for the lower East Fork of Virgin River Segment 48-49.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

State and local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs of designated streams.

Orderville Gulch (Esplin Gulch)—Segment 44-45

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, geologic, wildlife, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This entire segment is rated Class A scenery. This segment is similar in scenic qualities to those of adjacent Zion NP. The proposed segment has a slot waterfall just less than 100 feet in height.

Recreational

The outstanding scenery and wilderness-like setting make the trek along the river unique and exceptionally satisfying. Day use activities include hiking into portions of the canyon, nature photography, wildlife viewing, and occasional hunting. Private land upstream of the BLM segment limits OHV use to only an occasional authorized vehicle. There is no motorized travel allowed beyond the east boundary of the Orderville Canyon WSA. The trailhead parking area is located on private property that will probably be developed in the future. The trail below the waterfall is very primitive and steep. The segment enters Zion NP at the Kanab Field Office decision area boundary.

Wildlife

This segment contains designated critical habitat for the Mexican spotted owl and is adjacent to the protected activity center (PAC) for the Mexican spotted owl.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens).

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 92 percent federally managed public land. This segment is used by recreationists to access the Orderville Canyon Narrows hike in Zion NP. The upper reach of this segment, above the canyon narrows, is used for livestock grazing and dispersed recreation. Private land ownership upstream of the WSA could limit motorized access to the river segment.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Current recreational uses would be preserved by congressional designation, protecting the values associated with the non-motorized uses and the perceived natural condition and scenic values. Recreational enhancements would be limited to increased signage and management if designated.

The Orderville Canyon WSA includes 84 percent of the public lands along this segment. These lands have been recommended by BLM to Congress for wilderness designation. Designation of this stream into the NWSRS would be compatible with and would enhance wilderness use and management of the area.

Congressional designation would provide permanent protection specifically of the free-flowing condition of the river, its water quality, and its ORVs. This would be in addition to protection already afforded to the lower portions of the corridor by the WSA status. Failure to include this segment of Esplin Gulch in the NWSRS, on the other hand, would not necessarily diminish the values for which the river was determined eligible, inasmuch as the area's WSA status would continue. Furthermore, many of the other land use prescriptions (e.g., SRMA designation) being considered in the EIS would also preserve and enhance such values if implemented. Such prescriptions would be temporary, however, and could be changed through plan amendment or plan revision.

See last paragraph under suitability consideration #3 for the North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

The lower reaches of the Orderville Canyon drainage, of which Esplin Gulch is a tributary, extend within Zion NP, and the NPS has recommended for designation. Administration of recreation within the segment could be shared with Zion NP.

Local and state agencies and water users oppose designation primarily over their concerns that current and potential water use of this or any eligible stream could be affected. However, there are no current or foreseen uses that would be affected. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups have promoted the suitability of this stream for congressional designation. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See initial paragraph under suitability consideration #5 for North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above.

The free-flowing nature of this stream is not currently at risk, and the identified ORVs on public lands could be effectively managed under land use prescriptions being considered in the EIS, if designation does not occur and if the management prescriptions are implemented. These prescriptions would be associated with the Orderville Canyon WSA. The river corridor within the WSA is managed according to

the IMP. Protection would also be afforded by designation of the Orderville Canyon SRMA. The status of the WSA, SRMA, and other management prescriptions is subject to change due to congressional action or revised land use plans. Therefore, the protection these designations afford the river values is subject to change. However, the isolation of the stream due to the very limited public access and the extreme topography inevitably provides additional protection.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

See suitability consideration #6 for North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

State and local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs of designated streams.

Meadow Creek / Mineral Gulch—Segments 33-35 and 35-38

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic and recreational values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

The majority of this segment is class A scenery; with sculpted slickrock and canyon ledges untouched by human influence. Scenic values closely resemble those of side canyons of the East Fork Virgin River, of which Meadow Creek / Mineral Gulch is a tributary. Steep, towering canyon walls frame the winding creek bottom, with no road access and no human structures anywhere along the segment. Approximately 1 ½ miles upgradient from the East Fork Virgin River is a series of slot canyons.

Recreational

Recreation use tends to be light because physical access is difficult. Activities and uses probably consist mainly of occasional hikers and backpackers and a few adventurous hunters. The wild, pristine nature of the canyon offers exceptional solitude and superb opportunities for photography and wildlife and nature study.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 99 percent federally managed public lands.

Current uses include primitive types of recreation. The area is located within a livestock allotment, but difficult accessibility results in low use levels. This river segment is within the Parunuweap Canyon WSA and is managed according to the IMP. The IMP does not allow for new developments or surface-disturbing activity.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Uses and values that would be affected by congressional designation are also addressed in the cumulative impacts section of the EIS.

The area is popular for hunting. Livestock grazing occurs along this segment and on adjacent lands. There are range improvements to support livestock grazing. Designation could result in increased use that could change some recreation experiences and detract from solitude opportunities.

The Meadow Creek / Mineral Gulch segment corridor is 89 percent within the Parunuweap Canyon WSA. The portion of the WSA that includes this segment has been recommended by BLM to Congress for wilderness designation. Designation of this stream into the NWSRS would be compatible with and enhance wilderness use and management of the area.

See last two paragraphs under suitability consideration #3 for North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

Zion NP has not expressed any interest in designation. The current level of use is lower than that in the lower East Fork Virgin River.

State and local governments are unsupportive of congressional designation of this stream. Local and state agencies and water users oppose designation primarily over concerns that potential water use of this or any eligible stream could be affected. However, there are no current or foreseen water uses of Meadow Creek / Mineral Gulch that would be affected. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups have promoted the suitability of this stream for congressional designation. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See initial paragraph under suitability consideration #5 for North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above.

The BLM would be capable of managing this stream if it were designated, particularly with adequate funding. The BLM currently has little to no on-the-ground presence; however, the remoteness and difficult access have kept visitation light. Resources are fragile and could suffer degradation if visitation were to increase significantly with designation. Wild and Scenic River designation would increase the Utah BLM's ability to compete for agency dollars. With increased funding and focused management, the agency's ability to deal with recreational management of the area would improve. Designation would promote national and public recognition of the values associated with this stream and further the goals and policy established by Congress in the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act.

The free-flowing nature of this stream is not currently at risk, and the identified ORVs could be effectively managed under land use prescriptions being considered in the EIS, if designation does not occur and if the management prescriptions are implemented. These prescriptions would be associated with the Parunuweap SRMA. Protection is also currently afforded river values by the Parunuweap Canyon WSA. The river corridor within the WSA is managed according to the IMP. The status of the WSA, SRMA, and other management prescriptions is subject to change due to congressional action or revised land use plans. Therefore, the protection they afford the river values is subject to change.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

The initial costs of administration for the first 3 years would involve preparing a management plan. Yearly administration costs thereafter would involve plan implementation, and may include additional studies and monitoring as well as additional BLM presence in the area.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

State and local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs of designated streams.

Deep Creek—Segment 50-51

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic values. The entire segment is rated as Class A scenery. This segment has scenery reminiscent of the North Fork of the Virgin River, just outside of the Zion NP boundary.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 62 percent federally managed public lands.

Uses include recreation (particularly horseback riding, hunting, and hiking), livestock grazing, and wildlife habitat.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Uses and values that would be affected by congressional designation are also addressed in the cumulative impacts section of the EIS.

Inclusion of a river into the NWSRS could preclude construction of dams or other water-related projects if they would occur within the designated segment and would have direct and/or adverse effects on the outstandingly remarkable scenic values or free-flowing condition. Water-related projects proposed outside the segment would be precluded only if they would invade or unreasonably diminish scenic values within the designated segment.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

State and local governments are unsupportive of congressional determination of this stream. Local and state agencies, water users, and municipalities oppose designation primarily over their concerns that current and potential water use of this or any eligible stream could be affected. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups, however, have promoted the suitability of this stream for congressional designation. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

Land status and classification level would create problems for manageability because the segment is isolated and surrounded by private land. Although there are portions of this river upstream and downstream that are recommended for designation in the NWSRS, none of those are directly contiguous. The physical isolation and lack of legal public access would provide the greatest degree of protection to this area.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

The initial costs of administration for the first 3 years would involve preparing a management plan. Yearly administration costs thereafter would involve plan implementation, and may include additional studies and monitoring as well as a BLM presence in the area. If other portions of the river were designated, cost-sharing with the other agencies could reduce administrative costs.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

State and local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs of designated streams.

Cottonwood Creek—Segment 28-29

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

Cottonwood Creek possesses outstandingly remarkable recreational, cultural, and wildlife values. These values are described in detail below.

Recreational

Cottonwood Creek offers exceptional non-motorized/non-mechanized recreation opportunities in a scenic, enticing canyon setting. The variety of topography, vegetation, geology, and wildlife create a setting that is highly attractive to both day use hikers and overnight campers.

Cultural

There are two sites eligible for listing in the NRHP within the segment. NRHP -listed site 42Ka1581 Cottonwood Canyon Cliff Dwellings is within the segment corridor.

Wildlife

This segment includes neotropical migratory bird habitat; it is also a limited deer use area.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 87 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment is adjacent to the Moquith Mountain WSA, and 9 percent of the corridor is within the WSA, providing for primitive recreation. While the segment is not totally within the WSA, the corridor offers a scenic, solitary backcountry experience. The river segment is used for occasional recreational activities, including hunting, hiking, camping, wildlife viewing, and nature photography. There are no motorized routes along the segment. Although the area is open to livestock grazing, no use has occurred in the Water Canyon Allotment for several years. Fredonia has permitted water and public lands development rights dating to at least the 1940s. This segment corridor is used as a surface-water collection area for the Fredonia water source.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Congressional designation would provide permanent protection specifically of the free-flowing condition of the river, its water quality, and its ORVs. Designation of this river into the NWSRS would be compatible with and would enhance wilderness use and management of the Moquith Mountain WSA.

Inclusion of a river into the NWSRS could preclude construction of dams or other water-related projects if they would occur within the designated segment and would have direct and/or adverse effects on the ORVs or free-flowing condition. This could conflict with current water use of the surface water collection system and would prevent or restrict future water development. Other projects on federal lands within the designated river area, such as construction of roads, pipelines, or other structures, would not be allowed, and the lands would be closed to mineral location if Congress were to classify this segment as “wild.” Water-related projects proposed outside the segment would be precluded only if they would invade or unreasonably diminish recreational, cultural, or wildlife values within the designated segment. In addition to limiting future water developments for the town of Fredonia, congressional designation of this segment would advertise the canyons to the public, creating additional visitation, which would potentially impact the town’s water quality.

On the other hand, failure of Congress to include this segment in the NWSRS would not necessarily diminish the values on the basis of which the river was determined eligible because of the SRMA and Area of Critical Environmental Concern (ACEC) designations proposed for the canyon and the overlap and/or presence of the Moquith Mountain WSA. Likewise, the Cottonwood Canyon ACEC provides for the protection of certain values within the river corridor. Furthermore, the proposed Moquith Mountain SRMA would protect certain resources that contribute to the recreational values within the river segment. However, the status of the WSA, proposed SRMA, ACEC, and other management prescriptions are subject to change due to congressional action or future revisions to land use plans. Such prescriptions would be temporary, however, and could be changed through plan amendment or plan revision.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

Local and state agencies, municipalities, and water users oppose designation primarily over their concerns that current and potential water use of this or any eligible segment in this area could be affected. These organizations have expressed concerns that existing water rights and developments could be affected and that opportunities for future water development could be foreclosed, not only within the designated river segments but also upstream or downstream of these segments. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups have encouraged or promoted the suitability of this segment for congressional designation. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

The BLM would be capable of managing this segment if it were designated, particularly with adequate funding. Congressional designation of this segment into the NWSRS would increase the BLM’s ability to compete for agency dollars, and with increased funding and focused management, the agency’s ability to deal with recreational and other management of the area would improve. Designation would promote national and public recognition of the values associated with this segment and further the goals and policy established by Congress in the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act.

Designation of this segment would not result in a substantial change in management of the river corridor from current management. Other protective management prescriptions currently in place that would

complement NWSR management if the segment were designated are those for OHV use, fluid minerals leasing, SRMAs, ACECs, WSAs, riparian habitat, and visual resources. The current management would provide a large degree of continuity and make the adjustment into management of a “wild” and “scenic” area easy because current objectives are similar to those that would result from congressional designation.

The free-flowing nature of this segment is not currently at risk, and the identified ORVs could be effectively managed with existing and other land use prescriptions being considered in the EIS, if designation does not occur and if the management prescriptions are implemented. However, the status of the WSA, SRMA, ACEC, and other management prescriptions are subject to change due to congressional action or revised land use plans. Therefore, the protection they afford the river values is subject to change.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

The initial costs of administration for the first 3 years would involve preparing a management plan. Yearly administration costs thereafter would involve plan implementation, and may include additional studies and monitoring as well as additional BLM presence in the area. Funding is not expected to be sought for acquisition of adjacent private land (given willing sellers) because it would not be necessary to acquire these lands to adequately manage the designated segments.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

Local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs if this segment were designated.

Indian Canyon—Segment 26-27

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This canyon has Class A scenery, is picturesque, and is tightly confined in slickrock walls that are punctuated with enticing alcoves and dramatic amphitheaters. The lively small stream adds a water feature, and brilliant green vegetation winds through a landscape of colorful rimrock.

Recreational

Indian Canyon offers non-motorized, non-mechanized recreational opportunities in an exceptionally scenic canyon characterized by slickrock cliffs, ledges and pour-overs, scattered ponderosa pines, and many alcoves and recesses fringed with pockets of scrub oak and riparian vegetation.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens).

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 88 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment is adjacent to the Moquith Mountain WSA, with 17 percent of the corridor within the WSA, providing for primitive recreation. Although the segment is not totally within the WSA, the corridor offers a scenic, solitary backcountry experience. Although the area is open to livestock grazing, no use has occurred in the Water Canyon Allotment for several years. Fredonia has permitted water and public lands development rights dating to at least the 1940s. This segment corridor is used as a surface-water collection area for the Fredonia water source.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

See information under suitability consideration #3 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

See information under suitability consideration #4 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See information under suitability consideration #5 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

See information under suitability consideration #6 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

See information under suitability consideration #7 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

South Fork Indian Canyon—Segment 22-23

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This canyon has Class A scenery, is picturesque, and is tightly confined in slickrock walls that are punctuated with enticing alcoves and dramatic amphitheaters. The lively small stream adds a water feature, and brilliant green vegetation winds through a landscape of colorful rimrock.

Recreational

The South Fork Indian Canyon offers non-motorized, non-mechanized recreational opportunities in an exceptionally scenic canyon characterized by slickrock cliffs, ledges and pour-overs, scattered ponderosa pines, and many alcoves and recesses fringed with pockets of scrub oak and riparian vegetation.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens).

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 92 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment corridor is 100 percent contained within the Moquith Mountain WSA and is managed according to the IMP, which provides for primitive recreation. Uses also include livestock grazing, recreation, and wildlife habitat. The existing Water Canyon/South Fork Indian Canyon ACEC also overlaps 9 percent of the segment corridor. Although the area is open to livestock grazing, no use has occurred in the Water Canyon Allotment for several years. Fredonia has permitted water and public lands development rights dating to at least the 1940s. This segment corridor is used as a surface-water collection area for the Fredonia water source.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

See information under suitability consideration #3 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

See information under suitability consideration #4 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See information under suitability consideration #5 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

See information under suitability consideration #6 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

See information under suitability consideration #7 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

North Branch of South Fork Indian Canyon—Segment 24-25

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, cultural, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This canyon has Class A scenery, is picturesque, and is tightly confined in slickrock walls that are punctuated with enticing alcoves and dramatic amphitheaters. The lively small stream adds a water feature, and brilliant green vegetation winds through a landscape of colorful rimrock.

Recreational

The North Branch of South Fork Indian Canyon offers non-motorized, non-mechanized recreational opportunities in an exceptionally scenic canyon characterized by slickrock cliffs, ledges and pour-overs,

scattered ponderosa pines, and many alcoves and recesses fringed with pockets of scrub oak and riparian vegetation.

Cultural

This segment corridor contains one recorded cultural site, 42Ka1576 South Fork Indian Canyon Pictographs, that is eligible for listing in the NRHP . This is a significant rock art panel and is a popular local attraction and cultural interpretive site.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens). The sensitive plant species *Zion jamesia* is also present.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 82 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment corridor is 100 percent contained within the Moquith Mountain WSA and is managed according to the IMP, which provides for primitive recreation. Uses also include livestock grazing, recreation, and wildlife habitat. Primary recreational uses include rock art viewing, nature study, photography, and hiking. Local tourism boards promote this area for its prehistoric rock art and other cultural and historical values.

The existing Water Canyon/South Fork Indian Canyon ACEC also overlaps 6 percent of the segment corridor. Although the area is open to livestock grazing, no use has occurred in the Water Canyon Allotment for several years. Fredonia has permitted water and public lands development rights dating to at least the 1940s. This segment corridor is used as a surface-water collection area for the Fredonia water source.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

See information under suitability consideration #3 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing.

See information under suitability consideration #4 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See information under suitability consideration #5 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

See information under suitability consideration #6 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

See information under suitability consideration #7 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

Water Canyon—Segment 20-21

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This canyon has Class A scenery, is picturesque, and is tightly confined in slickrock walls that are punctuated with enticing alcoves and dramatic amphitheaters. The lively small stream adds a water feature, and brilliant green vegetation winds through a landscape of colorful rimrock.

Recreational

The South Fork Indian Canyon offers non-motorized, non-mechanized recreational opportunities in an exceptionally scenic canyon characterized by slickrock cliffs, ledges and pour-overs, scattered ponderosa pines, and many alcoves and recesses fringed with pockets of scrub oak and riparian vegetation.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens). The sensitive plant species *Zion jamesia* is also present.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 100 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment corridor is 100 percent within the Moquith Mountain WSA and is managed according to the IMP, which provides for primitive recreation. The IMP does not allow for new developments or surface-disturbing activity. Uses also include livestock grazing, recreation, and wildlife habitat. Other uses include more primitive types of recreation, such as hiking and camping by scout groups.

The existing Water Canyon/South Fork Indian Canyon ACEC also overlaps 17 percent of the segment corridor. Although the area is open to livestock grazing, no use has occurred in the Water Canyon Allotment for several years. Fredonia has permitted water and public lands development rights dating to at least the 1940s. This segment corridor is used as a surface-water collection area for the Fredonia water-source.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

See information under suitability consideration #3 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

See information under suitability consideration #4 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See information under suitability consideration #5 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

See information under suitability consideration #6 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

See information under suitability consideration #7 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

Hell Dive Canyon—Segment 30-31**1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System**

This segment possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, cultural, and ecologic values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

This canyon has Class A scenery, is picturesque, and is tightly confined in slickrock walls that are punctuated with enticing alcoves and dramatic amphitheaters. The lively small stream adds a water feature, and brilliant green vegetation winds through a landscape of colorful rimrock.

Recreational

The South Fork Indian Canyon offers non-motorized, non-mechanized recreational opportunities in an exceptionally scenic canyon characterized by slickrock cliffs, ledges and pour-overs, scattered ponderosa pines, and many alcoves and recesses fringed with pockets of scrub oak and riparian vegetation.

Cultural

One recorded rockshelter/rock art/structural site, 42Ka1695, in this segment is considered eligible for listing in the NRHP. No other sites have been documented in this canyon, but there is potential for finding additional sites in the cliffs and overhangs in the vicinity.

Ecologic

This segment contains unique plant communities (hanging gardens). The sensitive plant species *Zion jamesia* is also present.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 100 percent federally managed public lands.

This segment corridor is 88 percent within the Moquith Mountain WSA and is managed according to the IMP, which provides for primitive recreation. The IMP does not allow for new developments or surface-disturbing activity. Uses include recreation, particularly horseback riding and hiking, livestock grazing, and wildlife habitat. Although the area is open to livestock grazing, no use has occurred in the Water Canyon Allotment for several years. Fredonia has permitted water and public lands development rights dating to at least the 1940s. This segment corridor is used as a surface-water collection area for the Fredonia water-source.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

See information under suitability consideration #3 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

See information under suitability consideration #4 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See information under suitability consideration #5 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

See information under suitability consideration #6 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

See information under suitability consideration #7 for the Cottonwood Canyon segment above.

Paria River—Segment 68-69**1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System**

The Paria River possesses outstandingly remarkable scenic, recreational, and wildlife values. These values are described in detail below.

Scenic

Scenery within the Paria River canyon includes sheer, towering walls of colorful sandstone that frame overhead skies and a ribbon of water accented by wildflowers, intermittent scatterings of shrubs and grasses, and occasional cottonwood trees. Late summer thunderstorms provide contrasts in lighting, color, and texture. The deeply entrenched canyon wilderness also provides spectacular nighttime views through canyon walls reaching several hundred feet above the river bottom.

Recreational

The Paria River canyon offers the opportunity for spectacular hiking and backpacking in a unique, deeply entrenched, desert canyon far from the sights and sounds of civilization. Permits for overnight trips through the Paria are sought by visitors throughout the United States and overseas. The colorful, sheer sandstone cliffs bordering lush riparian vegetation provide exceptional photo opportunities. Wildlife viewing leads to frequent sightings of Desert bighorn sheep and a variety of raptors for visitors to this site. Day hikers can access portions of the canyon a few miles downstream from the White House campground and trailhead. Overnight visitors typically start their trek at White House and continue for 3 to 5 days, hiking the 38-mile stretch that terminates at Lee's Ferry on the Colorado River. Because the number of permits is regulated on a daily basis, backpackers have excellent opportunities to experience solitude and primitive, unconfined recreation in a unique setting.

Wildlife

The Paria River is important to numerous avian wildlife species, notably the peregrine falcon. The area also contains suitable habitat for the Mexican spotted owl, the Southwestern willow flycatcher, and the California condor. This river segment provides excellent nesting and roosting habitat for the Mexican spotted owl and the peregrine falcon, although their presence has not been confirmed to date. The river segment corridor is also important lambing habitat for Desert bighorn sheep.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 100 percent federally managed public lands. This segment corridor is 100 percent within the Paria Canyon–Vermilion Cliffs Wilderness Area and is managed according to the Wilderness Act and the Wilderness Management Plan, which specify managing the area for naturalness and providing opportunities for primitive recreation and solitude.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

Designation of this segment into the NWSRS would be compatible with and would enhance wilderness use and management of the area. Congressional designation would provide permanent protection specifically of the free-flowing condition of the river, its water quality, and its ORVs. This would be in addition to protection already afforded to the segment corridor by the wilderness area. A river management plan would be prepared on designation. As part of that effort, current activities may be monitored to ensure that activities are consistent with the goals of the designation.

Failure to include this segment in the NWSRS, on the other hand, would not necessarily diminish the values on the basis of which the segment was determined eligible, inasmuch as the area's wilderness area status would continue, and other land use prescriptions (e.g., SRMA designation) being considered in the EIS would also preserve and enhance such values if implemented. Such prescriptions would be temporary, however, and could be changed through plan amendment or plan revision.

Inclusion of a river in the NWSRS could preclude construction of dams or other water-related projects if they would occur within the designated segment and would have direct and/or adverse effects on the ORVs or free-flowing condition. Water-related projects proposed outside the segment would be precluded only if they would invade or unreasonably diminish those ORVs within the designated segment. No such projects inside or immediately outside of the river area are currently proposed.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

State and local governments are unsupportive of congressional designation of this stream. Some private citizens and regional and national conservation groups have promoted congressional designation of this river. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See initial paragraph under suitability consideration #5 for the North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above.

If the eligible segment of Paria Canyon was found to be not suitable and subsequently not designated by Congress, the ORVs (scenic, recreational, and wildlife) for which the segment is found to be eligible

would not necessarily diminish. The proposed Paria Canyon SRMA would be managed to offer a certain degree of protection to recreational values. Protection is also currently afforded ORVs by the existing wilderness designation. The wilderness, including this entire river segment, is managed according to the *Wilderness Management Plan for Paria Canyon–Vermilion Cliffs Wilderness*, which allows for no new permanent developments or surface-disturbing activities. The status of the SRMA and other management prescriptions are subject to change due to congressional action or revised land use plans. Therefore, the protection they afford the river values is subject to change.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

The initial costs of administration for the first 3 years would involve preparing a management plan. Yearly administration costs thereafter would involve plan implementation, and may include additional studies and monitoring as well as additional BLM presence in the area. Costs could be reduced if management were shared with the Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monument and the Arizona Strip Field Office, both of which manage segments upstream and downstream.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

State and local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs if the Paria River were designated.

Three Mile Creek—Segment 56-57

1. Characteristics that would or would not make it a worthy addition to the National Wild and Scenic Rivers System

Three Mile Creek possesses an outstandingly remarkable fish value. Bonneville cutthroat trout (sensitive species) are present.

2. Land ownership and current use

Ownership within the eligible segment corridor is 91 percent federally managed public lands. Uses include ranching, livestock grazing, wildlife habitat, and occasional recreational fishing.

3. Uses, including reasonably foreseeable uses, that would be enhanced or curtailed if designated; and values that would be diminished if not designated

A primary objective for the management of species managed by the Utah Division of Wildlife Resources (UDWR) is to enhance streams' coldwater fisheries habitat and populations. Designation would directly contribute to these objectives and also provide for protection of the other values within the stream corridor.

Inclusion of this segment in the NWSRS could preclude construction of dams or other water-related projects within the designated segment. This would enhance the viability of the Bonneville cutthroat trout population and protect the free-flowing condition. Other projects on federal lands within the designated river area, such as construction of roads, recreational facilities, or other structures, may be allowed along the segment classified by Congress as "recreational."

Failure to include Three Mile Creek in the NWSRS, on the other hand, would not necessarily diminish the values for which the river was determined eligible, inasmuch as management implemented in coordination with the UDWR would also preserve and enhance such values.

4. Interest of federal, public, state, tribal, local, or other public entity in designation or non-designation, including administration sharing

State and local governments are unsupportive of congressional designation of this stream. These governments oppose designation primarily over their perceptions that existing water rights could be affected and that opportunities for future water development could be foreclosed. The Kaibab band of the Southern Paiute Tribe supports any potential Wild and Scenic River designation.

5. Manageability of the river if designated, and other means of protecting values

See initial paragraph under suitability consideration #5 for the North Fork Virgin River Segment 48-49 above.

Cooperative management of Three Mile Creek by the BLM and the UDWR would be necessary if the stream were to be congressionally designated. This would be expected to be productive because current federal and state objectives for the area are consistent. The free-flowing nature of this stream is not currently at risk, and the identified ORVs on public lands could be effectively managed under land use prescriptions being considered in the EIS, if designation does not occur and if the management prescriptions are implemented.

6. The estimated costs of administering the river, including costs for acquiring lands

Initial costs of administration for the first 3 years would involve preparing a management plan. Yearly administration cost thereafter would involve plan implementation, and may include additional studies, monitoring, and additional BLM presence in the area. The BLM would make efforts to work cooperatively with the State of Utah to manage Three Mile Creek on designation.

7. The extent to which administration costs will be shared by local and state governments

Local governments have made it clear that they would not share management costs if Three Mile Creek were designated. Any cooperative management of Three Mile Creek between the BLM and the UDWR would potentially require commitments from both entities for adequate funding.